



Minister of Public Works

Ministry of Public Works

Oranapai Towers, Wight's Lane, Kingston, Georgetown,
Guyana

www.mopw.gov.gy / Tel: + 592-231-8127/28 / Cell: 592 615-5910 / Fax: 592 231-8114/ 226-2956

27 January 2021

Mr. Deodat Sharma
Auditor General
Audit Office of Guyana
High Street
Kingston
Georgetown.

Dear Mr. Sharma

Re: Request for a Forensic Audit of the Construction of Pedestrian overhead Walkways on the East Bank of Demerara – Ministry of Public Works.

Under LO-2215/BL-GY: Road Improvement and Rehabilitation Programme: Prioritized Intervention, East Bank Demerara, the following Contracts were executed on April 27, 2017 for the construction of five (5) Overhead Walkways:

- | | |
|---|---|
| (a) S. Jagmohan Hardware Supplies and Construction Services, Lot 32 first Street, Campbellville, Georgetown | (i) Contract Sum US\$364,246.80 at Providence; and |
| | (ii) US\$364,727 at Diamond |
| (b) B and J Civil Works
137 Section A, Triumph, East Coast Demerara | Total Contract Sum of \$1,034,326.35 at Houston, Eccles and Peter's Hall. |

These contracts were increased and the period extended to September 30, 2018. This was approved by the Inter-American Development Bank (IDB) and the National Procurement and Tender Administration Board (NPTAB).

In addition, the Ministry of Public Works (then Ministry of Public Infrastructure) had procured and installed five (5) complete solar photo voltaic systems at the five (5) pedestrian overhead walkways along the East Bank Demerara. The contract was signed on June 6, 2018, effective from July 8, 2018 with the Contractor being Farfan and Mendes Ltd. and Client, Ministry of Public Infrastructure for the supply, installation and maintenance (10 years) of Solar Photo Voltaic (PV) system at a cost of US\$502,213.65.

The Contracting Agency accepted the projects (Construction of the overhead walkways) as substantively completed and took over the works in accordance with Clause 56.1 of the Conditions of Contracts.

In the case of the Supply and Installation and Maintenance (10 years) of the Photo Voltaic (PV) Systems, the Contracting Agency accepted the project as substantially completed.

Copies of these documents are enclosed for your guidance.

In addition, the following documents are enclosed:

- Letter dated December 14, 2018 from Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Public Infrastructure to General Manager, RBP Lifts Ltd. re Request for technical support with camera installation and defects with Cibes Lifts in Guyana;
- Letter dated December 28, 2018 from Coordinator, Work Services Group, re Defects observed at Cibes elevators installed in Guyana and technical support for CCTV camera installation;
- Letter dated March 18, 2019 from Coordinator, Work Services Group to RBP Lifts Ltd. re Non-Resolution of defects observed at Cibes elevators installed in Guyana and technical support for CCTV Camera installation;
- Letter dated April 5, 2019 from Coordinator, Work Services Group to RBP Lifts Ltd. re Confirmation of date for resolution of defects observed at Cibes elevators installed in Guyana and technical support for CCTV camera installation;
- Letter dated April 10, 2019 from RBP Lifts Limited to Coordinator, Work Services Group re 10 Cibes Elevators Installation in Guyana;
- Letter dated April 11, 2019 from Coordinator, Work Services Group to RBP Lifts Ltd. re scheduled inspection for Cibes Elevators by RBP Lifts Ltd;
- Letter dated June 10, 2019 from Coordinator, Work Services Group to General Manager, Demerara Harbour Bridge Corporation re handing over project and related documentation.
- Letter dated June 21, 2019 from Coordinator, Work Services Group, to S. Jagmohan re resolution of matter involving payment.

- Letter dated July 25, 2019 from Coordinator, Work Services Group, to Chief Executive Officer, Cibes Lift Group re non-functioning of Cibes A5000 Lifts and request for warranty support
- Letter dated September 27, 2019 from the Coordinator, Work Services Group to the Chief Executive Officer, Cibes Lift Group re Non-functioning of Cibes A5000 Lifts and request for warranty support;
- Letter dated October 3, 2019 from RBP Lifts Ltd. to Ministry of Public Infrastructure re Pedestrian Overhead Walkways – Cibes A5000 Lifts;
- Letter dated November 2, 2019 from RBP Lifts Ltd to Ministry of Public Infrastructure re Pedestrian Overhead Crossing;
- Letter dated November 7, 2019 from Coordinator, Work Services Group to Cibes Lift Group re Cibes response on non-functioning of Lifts and request for Warranty Support;
- Letter dated November 8, 2019 from Coordinator, Work Services Group, to RBP Lifts Ltd re Ministry’s response to RBP’s letter regarding the non-operation Cibes A5000 Lifts;
- Letter dated December 31, 2019 from Coordinator, Work Services Group to Chief Executive Officer, Cibes Lift Group re request for update from Cibes on non-functioning of Lifts.

At the Engineering Conference on November 9, 2017, it was announced that the pedestrian overpasses and the elevators would be maintained and managed by the Demerara Harbour Bridge Corporation (DHBC). The infrastructure was handed over to Mr. Rawlston Adams, former General Manager, DHBC. Keys were handed over to Mr. Adams to access the electrical rooms which were completed along with the interconnection of the CCTV systems at each of the overpasses to that already existing at DHBC. In addition, the power supply from DHBC was used to provide electricity to the Peter’s Hall overpass and the DHBC and the NDMA / eGov installed equipment at the overpasses.

In April 2018, the Demerara Harbour Bridge Corporation (DHBC), signed an agreement with the, then Ministry of Public Infrastructure to manage, maintain and clean the overpass and immediate surroundings daily on the premise that revenue would be recovered to offset these costs from advertising.

The elevators were purchased from RBP Lifts (Trinidad) by the contractors and arrived in Guyana in February 2018. The installation commenced in June 11, 2018 and the DHBC was invited to witness the installation of the elevators. On October 12, 2018, the elevators were commissioned by the supplier, RPB Lifts (Trinidad), with the maintenance period commencing on November 1, 2018 for 1 year. Personnel identified by the DHBC were trained in the operation and maintenance of the elevators by the local representative for the elevator supplier, Mr. Thaddeus De Freitas. The four (4) quarterly maintenance were undertaken by Mr. De Freitas jointly with the DHBC personnel and who were present to learn the maintenance techniques that were required. This was supported by the technical information contained within the Elevator Manuals for essential

maintenance and upkeep of the elevators along with the list of essential spares that must be acquired and kept in stock to ensure the efficient and effective operation of the elevators. During the period from October 12, 2018 to August 17, 2019 the DHBC did not operate any of the elevators as per the agreement and elevators remained closed and unused. Also, during this period, there were several incidents of vandalism occurred including the cutting and damaging of cables, theft of lights, broken side glasses and an elevator door. In all of these incidents the Ministry carried out the repairs and replacement of the damaged items as DHBC could not provide any video footage of these incidents.

The Pedestrian Overpass Elevators at Peters Hall were subsequently commissioned on the 16th August 2019 and became operational to the Public. DHBC hired Six Staff to operate these elevators to transport pedestrians. Subsequent to the testing and commissioning of the elevator, at Peters Hall, DHBC has stated that various technical issues developed such as:

- Door lock not opening or closing
- Elevators malfunctioning while persons are inside
- Error displayed on the screen for faults on board
- Emergency errors and display screen errors during operation.

DHBC stated that the Company that installed the elevators RBP Lifts, local representative, Thaddeus De Freitas, who was responsible for quarterly maintenance of these elevators during the defect's liability period was summoned on numerous occasions in relation to issues outlined above. Some of the issues Mr. Defreitas was unable to rectify. This was related to Mark Greene Project Manager Donor Program (then Ministry of Public Infrastructure).

The issue of the incident on September 13, 2019 of persons being stuck in the elevator only came to the attention of the Ministry through social media. WSG then contacted DHBC to confirm that the incident had indeed taken place. This resulted in the Ministry contacting the supplier RBP Lifts (Trinidad) and manufacturer, Cibes Lifts Gp (Sweden) who responded that they would send a technical team on November 19, 2019 to inspect and repair the elevators not working. Both the General Manager and Andre Crowder of DHBC were contacted (telephone and email) about the scheduled visit by Cibes and RBP Lifts. The Ministry had an Electrical and Electronics Engineer, Mr. Keyron Mc Bean, witnessed and documented the repairs that took place. There was no representative present from DHBC. The repairs were undertaken and the elevators were made operational.

No further communication was received from DHBC as the said Agency's personnel had been trained and had been introduced to the local elevator representative, and there was no indication that the elevators were not performing or working as per manufacturer's specifications. There was also no notice from DHBC that the elevators were as a consequence closed.

DHBC has reported in this statement that subsequent to the rectification of these defects, the elevators started exhibiting the same issues. The elevators would work excellently for about 20 minutes then start exhibiting the same problems of not locking, or opening, errors indicating control board faults, screen displays malfunctioning. Mr. Defreitas on several occasions tried to rectify these issues with no success.

In February 2020, DHBC stopped operating the elevators at Peters Hall since the issues were not rectified and it was unsafe for the Public to use the elevators. At present all the elevators have various defects.

It should be noted that the project was fully funded by the Inter-American Development Bank and an Audit was done by the Audit Office- Loan Agreement 2215/BL-GY: Road Improvement and Rehabilitation Programme for the period January to September 2018.

In light of the foregoing, therefore, I would appreciate if you would arrange for a forensic audit to be carried out since, from all appearances, the Government of Guyana did not get value for money in relation to the installation and operation of the five (5) Elevators which was part of the project and still have not been completed for well over two years now.

I look forward to your urgent action in the matter.

With kind regards.

Yours sincerely



Bishop Juan Edghill

Minister of Public Works.